

## **GCE**

### **History A**

#### **Y304/01: The Church and medieval heresy c.1100-1437**

Advanced GCE

#### **2020 Mark Scheme (DRAFT)**

This is a DRAFT mark scheme. It has not been used for marking as this paper did not receive any entries in the series it was scheduled for. It is therefore possible that not all valid approaches to a question may be captured in this version. You should give credit to such responses when marking learner's work.

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA) is a leading UK awarding body, providing a wide range of qualifications to meet the needs of candidates of all ages and abilities. OCR qualifications include AS/A Levels, Diplomas, GCSEs, Cambridge Nationals, Cambridge Technicals, Functional Skills, Key Skills, Entry Level qualifications, NVQs and vocational qualifications in areas such as IT, business, languages, teaching/training, administration and secretarial skills.

It is also responsible for developing new specifications to meet national requirements and the needs of students and teachers. OCR is a not-for-profit organisation; any surplus made is invested back into the establishment to help towards the development of qualifications and support, which keep pace with the changing needs of today's society.


This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and students, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which marks were awarded by examiners. It does not indicate the details of the discussions which took place at an examiners' meeting before marking commenced.

All examiners are instructed that alternative correct answers and unexpected approaches in candidates' scripts must be given marks that fairly reflect the relevant knowledge and skills demonstrated.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the published question papers and the report on the examination.

© OCR 2021

## 1. Annotations

Annotation	Meaning of annotation
<b>BP</b>	Blank Page
	Highlight
Off-page comment	
<b>A</b>	Assertion
<b>AN</b>	Analysis
<b>EVAL</b>	Evaluation
<b>EXP</b>	Explanation
<b>F</b>	Factor
<b>ILL</b>	Illustrates/Describes
<b>IRRL</b>	Irrelevant, a significant amount of material that does not answer the question
<b>J</b>	Judgement
<b>KU</b>	Knowledge and understanding
<b>P</b>	Provenance
<b>SC</b>	Simple comment
	Unclear
<b>V</b>	View
<b>S</b>	Synthesis
<b>C</b>	Continuity/Change

## 2. Subject-specific Marking Instructions

### How far do you agree questions . . .

The indicative content lists features of the period studied that relate to the question set. Both features that support the hypothesis and features that challenge the hypothesis are detailed.

#### **Neither significance nor relative importance are attributed to the features listed.**

The indicative content is intended to reflect the knowledge and understanding a candidate is likely to analyse and evaluate in order to arrive at a judgement in line with the question set.

### Other questions . . .

The indicative content lists features of the period studied that relate to the question set.

#### **Neither significance nor relative importance are attributed to the features listed.**

The indicative content is intended to reflect the knowledge and understanding a candidate is likely to analyse and evaluate in order to arrive at a judgement in line with the question set.

Question	Answer	Mark	Guidance
1	<p><b>Evaluate the interpretations in both of the two passages and explain which you think is more convincing as an explanation of the reasons for the failure of Lollardy.</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>In locating the Interpretations within the wider historical debate</b> answers might argue that Interpretation A argues that Lollardy failed as a result of actions taken by the authorities from 1409 and culminating in actions taken by Henry V after the Oldcastle Rebellion which clearly associated Lollardy with sedition.</li> <li>• <b>In evaluating Interpretation A</b>, answers might argue that this interpretation is valid since Arundel's 'Constitutions' of 1409 restricted the preaching and reading of Wycliffe's ideas and ended academic freedom in the universities so destroying the original centre of Lollardy.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that Interpretation A is valid as</li> </ul>	30	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No set answer is required</li> <li>• At Level 5 and above answers will evaluate both interpretations, locating them within the wider historical debate about the issue and using their own knowledge and reach a balanced judgement as to which they consider the most convincing about the issue in the question</li> <li>• To be valid, judgements must be supported by relevant and accurate material</li> <li>• Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used to analyse and evaluate the interpretations, in line with the descriptions in the levels mark scheme.</li> </ul>

Question	Answer	Mark	Guidance
	<p>Henry V used Oldcastle's Rebellion as an excuse to arrest suspected Lollards and hanged over 100 for treason.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Answers might argue that Interpretation A is valid as the decline in support for Lollardy after the Oldcastle Rebellion suggests government action was effective.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that Interpretation A is valid as Henry V crushed Lollardy by introducing the Statute of Lollards which gave state officials the power to cooperate with the church to prosecute Lollards.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that Interpretation A is less convincing as it does not mention 'de heretico comburendo' which had already been passed against heretics in 1401.</li> </ul> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>In locating the Interpretations within the wider historical debate</b> answers might argue that Interpretation B agrees with Interpretation A that Lollardy failed because of persecution as a result of the link between Lollardy and sedition but also argues that Lollardy failed for a number of reasons, particularly its lack of gentry support both before and after the Oldcastle Rebellion.</li> <li>• <b>In evaluating Interpretation B</b>, answers might argue that it is valid as Lollardy failed to attract many gentry after the early years and there is no evidence of the involvement of knights and very little of gentry involvement after the Oldcastle Rebellion.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that Interpretation B is valid as it is supported by Interpretation A in arguing that after Oldcastle's Rebellion, Lollard beliefs were linked to sedition and that the government took action.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that Interpretation B is valid as the passing of the Statute 'de heretico comburendo'</li> </ul>		

Question	Answer	Mark	Guidance
2*	<p>in 1401 had not led to much action against heretics.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Answers might argue that Interpretation B is less valid as Lollardy was not a social protest movement and gained more support from graduate clergy, lawyers, yeomen and the middling sort than from radical groups.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that Interpretation B is less valid as in the early years Lollardy attracted support among the Lollard knights and even from John of Gaunt.</li> </ul> <p><b>How far were the Cathars typical of heretical movements in the period from 1100 to 1437?</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>In supporting the hypothesis in the question,</b> answers might argue that there were similarities between many aspects of Catharism and other heretical movements.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that the Cathar heresy sprang from doctrinal issues which is also partly the case with Wycliffe and the Hussites.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that local political factors helped lead to the spread of Catharism and that this is similar to the Lollards in England and the Hussites in Bohemia.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that inability or unwillingness of the authorities to deal with Catharism helped it to take hold and this is in some ways similar to the Waldensians, Lollards and Hussites.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that the Cathars sought purer and more austere lives and this is also true of Waldensians, Henricians, Free Spirits, Fraticelli.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that, like most other heretical</li> </ul>	25	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No set answer is expected</li> <li>• At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge</li> <li>• To be valid judgments must be supported by relevant and accurate material</li> <li>• Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.</li> </ul>

Question	Answer	Mark	Guidance
3*	<p>groups, Cathars were supported by both men and women.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Answers might argue that like other heretical movements Catharism did not last as a force throughout the period.</li> <li>• <b>In challenging the hypothesis in the question</b> it might be argued that the Cathars got more support from influential members of society than did most heretical groups</li> <li>• Answers might argue that the Cathars did not follow a Gospel based life style as did some other groups.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that Cathars attracted the particular ire of the papacy under Innocent III and were one of only two groups to merit a crusade against them.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that the Cathars' alternative theology, rites and church services set them apart from other heretical groups.</li> </ul> <p><b>'Heresy presented an ever-increasing challenge to the medieval Church in the period from 1100 to 1437.' How far do you agree?</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>In supporting the hypothesis in the question,</b> answers might argue that in the earlier period movements tended to attack clerical abuses which was not as serious a challenge as the later attacks on papal authority.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that in the earlier period emphasis was on following the gospel life but that doctrinal differences and demands for church disendowment in the later period show an increasing challenge to the Church.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that preaching was used effectively against some heretics in the early period,</li> </ul>	25	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No set answer is expected</li> <li>• At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge</li> <li>• To be valid judgments must be supported by relevant and accurate material</li> <li>• Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.</li> </ul>

Question	Answer	Mark	Guidance
	<p>such as the Henricians, but later repressive measures, growing in diversity, suggest the Church was facing an increasing challenge as time went on.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Answers might argue that the Cathars, with their alternative church, were eradicated by 1310 but the Hussite alternative church became permanent, so indicating a greater challenge.</li> <li>• <b>In challenging the hypothesis in the question</b> it might be argued that there was not a pattern of increasing challenge to the Church as the period progressed.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that throughout the period, heretical groups tended to be geographically limited.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that throughout the period the amount of support for heretical groups varied.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that throughout the period, some groups were easier to deal with than others. Cathars were difficult to combat in the thirteenth century while Lollards were effectively dealt with in the fifteenth.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that even though a crusade was believed to be necessary to deal with the Cathars the Church still felt in the thirteenth century that preaching could be an effective tool in stopping the spread of heresy.</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No set answer is expected</li> <li>• At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge</li> <li>• To be valid judgments must be supported by relevant and accurate material</li> <li>• Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.</li> </ul>



Question	Answer	Mark	Guidance
4*	<p><b>'The activities of the spiritual orders were the most effective means of maintaining Church authority in the period from 1100 to 1437.'</b> How far do you agree?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>In supporting the hypothesis in the question</b>, answers might argue that the spiritual orders, Dominicans and Franciscans, preached effectively in support of church authority. The Dominicans were set up specifically to preach against heresy and uphold orthodoxy while the Franciscans were used effectively as missionaries preaching to the poor and dispossessed so encouraging them to maintain their loyalty to the Church.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that the spiritual orders upheld the authority of the Church in urban centres which were otherwise without orthodox pastoral support.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that the spiritual orders were very influential in the universities where they taught, so upholding church authority among students and so influencing the next generation.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that the personalities of Francis and Dominic attracted support for their preaching.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that the lifestyle of the friars attracted people and helped them to remain loyal to the Catholic Church.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that the Franciscan order, the Poor Clares, were attractive to women and so helped to encourage them to accept church authority.</li> <li>• <b>In challenging the hypothesis in the question</b> it might be argued that lack of numbers among the Dominicans made them less effective preachers than they might have been in support of church authority.</li> <li>• Answers might argue that divisions among the Franciscans and the way the Church dealt with them undermined church authority.</li> </ul>	25	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No set answer is expected</li> <li>• At higher levels answers might establish criteria against which to judge</li> <li>• To be valid judgments must be supported by relevant and accurate material</li> <li>• Knowledge must not be credited in isolation, it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.</li> </ul>

Question	Answer	Mark	Guidance
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Answers might argue that church councils were used to maintain church authority.</li><li>• Answers might argue that, for all the preaching and missionary work of the spiritual orders, the Church still had to have recourse to a variety of repressive measures to uphold its authority: crusades, inquisition, burning, banning of books, imprisonment, excommunication etc and that by the end of the period it was fear, rather than the spiritual orders, which was the most effective means of maintaining Church authority.</li></ul>		

**OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations)**  
**The Triangle Building**  
**Shaftesbury Road**  
**Cambridge**  
**CB2 8EA**

**OCR Customer Contact Centre**

**Education and Learning**

Telephone: 01223 553998

Facsimile: 01223 552627

Email: [general.qualifications@ocr.org.uk](mailto:general.qualifications@ocr.org.uk)

[www.ocr.org.uk](http://www.ocr.org.uk)

For staff training purposes and as part of our quality assurance programme your call may be recorded or monitored