

## **GCE**

### **History A**

#### **Y215/01: Italy and unification 1789-1896**

Advanced GCE

#### **2020 Mark Scheme (DRAFT)**

This is a DRAFT mark scheme. It has not been used for marking as this paper did not receive any entries in the series it was scheduled for. It is therefore possible that not all valid approaches to a question may be captured in this version. You should give credit to such responses when marking learner's work.

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA) is a leading UK awarding body, providing a wide range of qualifications to meet the needs of candidates of all ages and abilities. OCR qualifications include AS/A Levels, Diplomas, GCSEs, Cambridge Nationals, Cambridge Technicals, Functional Skills, Key Skills, Entry Level qualifications, NVQs and vocational qualifications in areas such as IT, business, languages, teaching/training, administration and secretarial skills.

It is also responsible for developing new specifications to meet national requirements and the needs of students and teachers. OCR is a not-for-profit organisation; any surplus made is invested back into the establishment to help towards the development of qualifications and support, which keep pace with the changing needs of today's society.


This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and students, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which marks were awarded by examiners. It does not indicate the details of the discussions which took place at an examiners' meeting before marking commenced.

All examiners are instructed that alternative correct answers and unexpected approaches in candidates' scripts must be given marks that fairly reflect the relevant knowledge and skills demonstrated.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the published question papers and the report on the examination.

© OCR 2021

**1. Annotations**

<b>Annotation</b>	<b>Meaning of annotation</b>
<b>BP</b>	Blank Page
	Highlight
Off-page comment	
<b>A</b>	Assertion
<b>AN</b>	Analysis
<b>EVAL</b>	Evaluation
<b>EXP</b>	Explanation
<b>F</b>	Factor
<b>ILL</b>	Illustrates/Describes
<b>IRRL</b>	Irrelevant, a significant amount of material that does not answer the question
<b>J</b>	Judgement
<b>KU</b>	Knowledge and understanding
<b>P</b>	Provenance
<b>SC</b>	Simple comment
	Unclear
<b>V</b>	View

## 2. Subject Specific Marking Instructions

### How far do you agree questions . . .

The indicative content lists features of the period studied that relate to the question set. Both features that support the hypothesis and features that challenge the hypothesis are detailed.

#### **Neither significance nor relative importance are attributed to the features listed.**

The indicative content is intended to reflect the knowledge and understanding a candidate is likely to analyse and evaluate in order to arrive at a judgement in line with the question set.

### Other questions . . .

The indicative content lists features of the period studied that relate to the question set.

#### **Neither significance nor relative importance are attributed to the features listed.**

The indicative content is intended to reflect the knowledge and understanding a candidate is likely to analyse and evaluate in order to arrive at a judgement in line with the question set.

Question		Answer	Mark	Guidance
1	(a)	<p><b>Which had the greater impact on Italy during the years from 1861 to 1896?</b></p> <p>(i) War (ii) Trasformismo</p> <p><b>Explain your answer with reference to both (i) and (ii).</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>In arguing war had the greater impact,</b> answers may suggest that it determined the creation of the Italian kingdom as it was only because of Garibaldi's invasion of the South that the whole peninsula was unified in 1861.</li> <li>Answers may suggest that, similarly, only the Franco-Prussian War enabled the kingdom to make Rome its capital.</li> <li>Answers may suggest that the defeats of the Italians at Custoza and Lissa in 1866 did much to undermine the reputation of the new kingdom in its early years.</li> <li>Answers may suggest that the French occupation of Tunisia in 1881 led a discredited</li> </ul>	10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Judgement must be supported by relevant and accurate material.</li> <li>Only credit material relevant to 'the greater impact on Italy during the years 1861-96'.</li> <li>Answers may deal with each factor in turn, then compare them to reach a judgement, or make a continually comparative approach. Either approach is acceptable.</li> <li>Knowledge must not be credited in isolation. It should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme</li> </ul>

		<p>government to abandon its traditional enmity for Austria and enter the Triple Alliance in 1882.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Answers may suggest it was the Italian defeat at Dogali which brought Crispi into power and her defeat at Adowa which brought an end to his career.</li><li>• <b>In arguing trasformismo had the greater impact</b>, answers may suggest that its introduction in 1883 seemed to confirm accusations of corruption and malfunction within the Italian parliamentary system.</li><li>• Answers may suggest that trasformismo prevented the emergence of a properly functioning party system and therefore fed the idea that the principles of the <i>Risorgimento</i> had been betrayed and that the Italian state was incapable of dealing with the problems with which it was confronted.</li><li>• Answers may suggest it was trasformismo which led to a growing dissatisfaction at the contrast between Italy on the one hand and Britain/France on the other.</li><li>• In the face of these criticisms of the Italian political system, governments felt a growing need in the 1880s and 1890s to present a vision of what it meant to be 'Italian' and to distract opponents of the kingdom by means of foreign success in acquiring colonies.</li><li>• Both Depretis and Crispi were masters of <i>trasformismo</i> and this encouraged the view Italian politics were about 'management' rather than genuine achievement. This also meant Italy's deep-rooted problems such as the North/South divide were not tackled.</li></ul>		
--	--	--	--	--

1	(b)*	<p><b>'The establishment of the Kingdom of Italy during the years from 1789 to 1861 was principally a French achievement.'</b> How far do you agree?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>In arguing the establishment of the Kingdom of Italy was principally a French achievement</b>, answers may refer to the failure of Italian nationalists in 1848/9 and contrast this to the situation in 1861, accounting for the difference by the presence of Napoleon III on the French throne.</li> <li>• Answers may refer to the long-term effects of French interest in Italy, citing specifically those of the French Revolution and of the first Napoleon.</li> <li>• Answers may refer to Napoleon III's oft-stated support of Italy.</li> <li>• Answers may refer to the role of Napoleon III in the war against Austria in 1859.</li> <li>• Answers may refer to the joint achievements and working relationship of Napoleon III and Cavour.</li> <li>• Answers may refer to the importance of Napoleon III's change of policy following Villafranca.</li> <li>• <b>In arguing the establishment of the Italian kingdom was not principally a French achievement</b>, answers may consider the long-term growth of Italian nationalism and the work of Mazzini, Danin, etc..</li> <li>• Answers may refer to the attitude of other great powers besides France and, especially, to the growing weakness of Austria.</li> <li>• Answers may refer to the frequent failure of Napoleon III to make concrete his promises of support for Italy and his reluctance to accept the unification of the peninsula in 1861.</li> </ul>	20	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No set answer is expected.</li> <li>• At higher levels candidates will focus on 'how far do you agree', but at level 4 may simply list reasons.</li> <li>• At level 5 and above there will be judgement as to the relative importance of different reasons.</li> <li>• At higher levels candidates might establish criteria against which to assess the different reasons.</li> <li>• To be valid judgements, claims must be supported by relevant and accurate material. If not, they are assertions.</li> <li>• Knowledge must not be credited in isolation; it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.</li> </ul>
---	------	---	----	---

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Answers may refer to the importance of the growth of Piedmont and, particularly, to the work of Cavour.</li> <li>Answers may refer to the importance of Garibaldi and his conquest of the South.</li> <li>Answers may refer to the importance of the successes and failures of Italian rulers.</li> </ul>		
2	(a)	<p><b>Who was more important in the establishment of the Kingdom in Italy in 1861?</b></p> <p>(i) Cavour (ii) Napoleon III</p> <p><b>Explain your answer with reference to both (i) and (ii).</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>In arguing Cavour was more important,</b> answers may suggest that it was Cavour's reforms in Piedmont which made her the most modern state in Italy, able to lead the unification of the peninsula. Such arguments may refer to his support for free trade, banking and reform of the Piedmontese bureaucracy.</li> <li>Answers may refer to the importance of Cavour's support for Britain and France during the Crimean War.</li> <li>Answers may refer to the support for Cavour of the National Society.</li> <li>Answers may refer to Cavour's reaction to the attempted Orsini assassination and to his meeting with Napoleon III at Plombières.</li> <li>Answers may refer to Napoleon III's reaction to Cavour's double-dealing during the 1859 war against Austria.</li> <li>Answers may refer to Cavour's response to Garibaldi's success in the South.</li> </ul>	10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Judgement must be supported by relevant and accurate material.</li> <li>Only credit material relevant to 'who was more important in the establishment of the kingdom of Italy in 1861'.</li> <li>Answers may deal with each factor in turn, then compare them to reach a judgement, or make a continually comparative approach. Either approach is acceptable.</li> <li> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Knowledge must not be credited in isolation. It should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>In arguing Napoleon III was more important</b>, answers may refer to the marked difference in power and status of the two men.</li> <li>• Answers may refer to the failure of Italians during 1848/9 to withstand the Austrians and note the difference brought about by Napoleon III's accession to power in France owing to his determination to reduce Hapsburg power.</li> <li>• Answers may refer to Napoleon III's marked reluctance to promote Italian interests despite his public statements to the contrary. Reference may be made here, for example, to the secret treaty he made with Austria following the Crimean War and his initial reaction to the attempted Orsini assassination.</li> <li>• Answers may refer to the promises made by Napoleon III at Plombières and his offer of leadership of the war against Austria.</li> <li>• Answers may refer to Napoleon III's ending of the same war against Austria and to his actions at Villafranca.</li> <li>• Answers may refer to Napoleon III's annexation of Savoy and Nice and his reaction to Garibaldi's success in the South.</li> </ul>		
2	(b)*	<p><b>'The advances made by Italy during the years from 1861 to 1870 were reversed during the years from 1871 to 1896.' How far do you agree?</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>In arguing the advances made during the years 1861-70 were reversed during the years 1871-96</b>, answers may refer to the successful growth of Italian unity during the first period with the creation of the kingdom itself in 1861, the defeat of pro-Bourbon opposition in the South by 1865 and the establishment of Rome as Italy's capital in 1870. This may then</li> </ul>	20	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No set answer is expected.</li> <li>• At higher levels candidates will focus on 'how far do you agree', but at level 4 may simply list reasons.</li> <li>• At level 5 and above there will be judgement as to the relative importance of different reasons.</li> <li>• At higher levels candidates might establish criteria against which to assess the different reasons.</li> <li>• To be valid judgements, claims must be supported by relevant and accurate material. If not, they are assertions.</li> </ul>



		<p>be compared to the increasing disunity of the later period and, especially, the failure to tackle the North/South divide.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Answers may refer to the imposition of the Piedmontese system of administration throughout the peninsula in the 1860s and the introduction of free trade in the South and contrast this to the increasing failure to maintain the same developments in both North and South during the 1880s and 1890s.</li> <li>• Answers may refer to the defeat of the Brigands' War in the 1860s and contrast this to the growth of Socialism in the 1880s and 1890s, noting the latter's opposition to the Italian state.</li> <li>• Answers may refer to the success of the 1860s in driving Austrian influence out of Italy and contrast this with the general abandonment of the irredentist cause after 1870 and the rapprochement with Austria indicated by the Triple Alliance of 1882. Reference may also be made to the humiliation of Adowa in 1896.</li> <li>• Answers may refer to the weakening of the influence of the Papacy occasioned by the seizure of the majority of the Papal States and, finally, that of Rome in 1870 and contrast it to the growing strength of the Vatican after 1870 with the creation of the <i>Opera dei Congressi</i> in 1874.</li> <li>• Answers may refer to the hopes of the 1860s that the benefits of liberalism would produce support for the new kingdom and contrast this to the problems produced by the economic slowdown which followed 1870 and the growth of opposition to the liberal state which followed. Reference may also be made here to the disillusionment brought about by the operation of <i>trasformismo</i> seen as originating in 1883.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• • Knowledge must not be credited in isolation; it should only be credited where it is used as the basis for analysis and evaluation, in line with descriptions in the levels mark scheme.</li> </ul>
--	--	---	---

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <b>In arguing the advances of 1861-70 were not reversed in the years which followed,</b> answers may well point out that the successes of the first decade may easily be exaggerated. They may argue Italian unification was achieved ‘accidentally’ and that the Brigands’ War demonstrated only too clearly the lack of unity apparent immediately after the creation of the Italian kingdom. Rather than the years after 1870 showing a reversal of Italian success, they therefore demonstrated a continuation of its problems.</li><li>• Answers may refer to the widespread demonstrations organised by Republicans in Sicily throughout the 1860s.</li><li>• Rather than seeing the introduction of Piedmontese systems of government as a positive, answers may well suggest that this simply reflected the lack of understanding of the South by Cavour and his successors, meaning the North/South divide was a problem from the very beginning of the period.</li><li>• Answers may refer to the cost of the Brigands’ War and the sense of disillusionment with the new kingdom which that war brought about as early as the mid-1860s.</li><li>• Answers may argue conversely that the ‘myth of the <i>Risorgimento</i>’ was, in fact stronger after 1870 with, for example, the erection of monuments to Garibaldi and to Victor Emmanuel II. Such arguments may see 1876 as a positive turning point as, following that, Depretis proved far more sensitive to the needs of the South and reforms of the electoral system and education followed in the 1880s.</li><li>• Answers may point out that the 1860s had witnessed military defeat at Custoza and Lissa and that the conclusion of the Triple Alliance</li></ul>		
--	--	--	--	--

			<p>was, in fact, an attempt to raise Italy's international prestige.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Answers may point out that though the origins of <i>trasformismo</i> can be dated in 1883, in fact Cavour had operated a very similar system in Piedmont in the 1850s and that accusations of corruption amongst politicians had plagued the 1860s as seen in the 'Tobacco Scandal' of 1868/9.</li><li>• Answers may contrast the 'sense of mission' of Crispi with, for example, the attitude of Cavour towards Italy in 1861.</li></ul>		
--	--	--	--	--	--

**OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations)**  
**The Triangle Building**  
**Shaftesbury Road**  
**Cambridge**  
**CB2 8EA**

**OCR Customer Contact Centre**

**Education and Learning**

Telephone: 01223 553998

Facsimile: 01223 552627

Email: [general.qualifications@ocr.org.uk](mailto:general.qualifications@ocr.org.uk)

[www.ocr.org.uk](http://www.ocr.org.uk)

For staff training purposes and as part of our quality assurance programme your call may be recorded or monitored